



Minutes of Garda Appointments Quality Assurance and Selection Governance Committee

Date: 11 November 2022

Venue: Remote Video Conference

Attendance:

Committee Members: Bryan Andrews (Chair), Moling Ryan, Valerie Judge

Executive: Helen Hall, Aoife Clabby, Clare Kelly, Sharon O'Brien, Shona Keeshan, David Murphy

1. Minutes of Previous Meeting

The minutes of the previous meetings held on 1 March 2022 and 28 March 2022 were approved and cleared for publication.

2. Review of 2022 Competition Processes and Recommendations Arising

Following the completion of the review of the 2022 Senior Garda Competitions, a draft report on the matter was considered by the Appointments and Quality Assurance Committee.

The Committee noted that, based on the feedback from the range of sources that had been consulted, there was very positive endorsement of the professionalism and integrity of the competition processes and an overall sense that the competitions were being run well. The Committee agreed that any measures that may further enhance the process or the perception of fairness should be given consideration.

The proposals that were considered by the Committee are set out in the table below. The Committee reached agreement on a number of proposals at the meeting, as indicated in the table.

The Committee discussed a possible approach in relation to shortlisting which involved rating candidates based on their form and combining the rating for each candidate with the results of their Situational Judgement Testing (SJT). The Committee decided to take time for further reflection in relation to the proposed approach to shortlisting (proposals 7 and 9) below. It was agreed that the Executive would further reflect on these two proposals and revert to the Committee for their consideration.

Proposals on the competition materials, briefings and scheduling of competitions		
1.	It is proposed to add further clarity to the application form and candidate information booklet where possible.	Agreed

2.	Word counts would be included in all sections including footnotes with the introduction of further measures to mitigate the risk of 'workarounds' by candidates.	Agreed
3.	HR&PD are proposing to hold preparatory briefings of Garda members in advance of the 2023 competitions. The Authority Executive would work with HR&PD and provide material relating to the competition process and what is expected. This would however be in the context of the Authority solely supporting HRPD, but not being directly involved in briefings of potential applicants.	Agreed
4.	The value of useful feedback will continue to be conveyed and emphasised to selection boards at training, but in the context that their feedback relates to how the person interviewed and that development of candidates is not the role of Selection Board.	Agreed
5.	The Executive will endeavour to avoid scheduling interviews in July and will communicate the dates well in advance.	Agreed
Proposals on the manner in which SJTs will be used in the Superintendent and Chief Superintendent competition at the shortlisting stage		
6.	To introduce additional safeguards to protect the integrity of the SJT process as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. proctoring, ii. time limits and iii. a shorter testing window. 	Agreed
7.	To amend the process of shortlisting so that the selection board considers all application forms in addition to SJTs rather than only the candidates who score above the 30 th percentile. Previously the bottom percentile were excluded and the selection board only considered candidates who ranked above that.	Further reflection needed
8.	Consider whether to retain the assessment of two competencies (as is) or to ask the selection boards to review more than two competencies at the shortlisting stage.	Retain as is
9.	To mark competencies at shortlisting and to combine with a mark related to each candidate's outcome in the SJT. SJT marks would be provided to the selection board after they have allocated the marks based on the form.	Further reflection needed
Proposals on enhancing the use of the presentation as part of the interview process at the final interview stage in all three competitions		
10.	A number of presentations topics would be identified so that candidates would not all present on the same topic and candidates would have a choice.	Agreed
11.	Candidates would be asked to submit <u>material</u> on their selected topic in advance of the interview.	Agreed
12.	Candidates would be questioned more rigorously on their presentation and it would be scored.	Agreed

Proposal on panelling of candidates

13.	Consider recommending that the Authority gives consideration to aligning promotional vacancies more closely with projected vacancies when putting panels in place.	Agreed but continue to allow for contingency
-----	--	--

3. Review of Committee Terms of Reference

The Committee Terms of Reference were reviewed. The Committee approved the Terms of Reference with no changes.

4. Competency Frameworks Procurement

An update was provided to the Committee on the procurement of a service provider to develop new Competency Frameworks for the three senior Garda ranks. Having regard to the value of the contract, the invitation to tender had been advertised in the Official Journal of the EU (OJEU) and on eTenders. The closing date for receipt of tenders was 28 September.

The Committee noted that the Evaluation Committee had selected a Preferred Tenderer and that the proposal to award the contract to the Preferred Tenderer had been approved by the Authority on 3 November.

5. AOB

A date for the next committee meeting will be determined at a future date.